Racing Rules of Sailing

Submission: **140-19**

Rule 2

A submission from the Chairman of the Race Officials Committee

Purpose or Objective

To remove the ambiguity and potential inconsistency that has arisen from the two options for a penalty in rule 2.

Proposal

2 FAIR SAILING

A boat and her owner shall compete in compliance with recognized principles of sportsmanship and fair play. A boat may be penalized under this rule only if it is clearly established that these principles have been violated. The penalty shall be either disqualification or a disqualification that is not excludable.

Current Position

As above.

Reasons

- 1. The 2017-2020 rulebook introduced a simple disqualification as an additional option for a penalty for a breach of rule 2. This change implied that there are now two options for penalties: DSQ or DNE. This change has caused confusion among judges about the cases in which either of the two penalties should be applied. Such confusion has introduced inconsistency between protest committees, as the same breach is penalised differently across different events. Such inconsistency is unhealthy for competitors and judges and should be clearly avoided.
- 2. When the change was discussed before being approved, it was promised that a case would be published to clarify in which situations the two penalties should be used. Unfortunately, that has not happened, despite several submission of cases on this. Therefore, there continues to be inconsistency in the application of the rule as explained above.
- 3. The International Judges Sub-committee has worked on guidelines for when the two penalties should be applied. During that, it turned out that a vast majority of judges would always give a DNE once it was decided that rule 2 was broken by a clear violation of the principles of sportsmanship. This illustrates very clearly that there is no practical need for the DSQ option.
- 4. Fair sailing is a fundamental principle in our sport, and rule 2 is a fundamental rule. Therefore, if a boat breaks rule 2, the penalty for breaking it should be stronger than for

Submission: 140-19 Cont'd

breaking other rules in the rule book, just like it has traditionally been. A DNE clearly differentiates a breach of rule 2 from breaches of most other rules.

- 5. Sailing is a sport where the rules and penalties are the same from a youth club level event to the Olympic Games. Therefore, for the same breach, the penalty should be the same. The option of DSQ and DNE without any clarification at all when to apply one or the other penalty only leads to ambiguity and inconsistency.
- 6. Some have argued that there are certain lower level events where a DSQ would be the appropriate penalty for a breach of rule 2. While this may be a valid point of view, the introduction of the DSQ option has caused inconsistency also at higher level events. Thus experience has shown that we have to choose between either availability of a lenient penalty for lower level events or consistency for all events, including top level events; it is not possible to have both. In that case, we must prioritise consistency and delete the DSQ option.