

ISAF Racing Rules Question and Answer Service



C 001

Q&A 2014.015

Published: 4 August 2014

Situation 1

A race is started under rule 30.3, Black Flag Rule. There is an incident in the minute before the starting signal between boats A and B. The race committee sees part of Boat A on the course side. Boat A does not return to the pre-start side of the starting line. She continues to sail the course and finishes the race. The race committee scores her BFD.

Boat A lodges a valid protest against Boat B. The protest committee penalizes Boat B for breaking a rule of Part 2. It finds that Boat A was compelled to break rule 30.3 by the actions of Boat B. It also finds that there was no injury or physical damage, and that Boat B did not break rule 2, Fair Sailing.

Question 1

May the protest committee exonerate Boat A for her breach of rule 30.3, and score her in her finishing position even though Boat A has never started according to the definition Start?

Answer 1

No. Boat A has broken rule 30.3 but has also failed to comply with the definition Start. The breach of Boat B compelled Boat A to break rule 30.3 however, it did not prevent her from sailing back to the pre-start side of the starting line and start correctly. The protest committee may exonerate Boat A under rule 64.1(a) for her breach of rule 30.3, and in such a case, the race committee shall score her DNS under A5.

Question 2

The situation before the starting signal is the same, but this time Boat A returned to the pre-start side of the starting line, started correctly, and then continued to sail the course and finished. May Boat A be exonerated by the protest committee under rule 64.1(a) for her breach of rule 30.3 and be scored in her finishing position?

Answer 2

Yes

Question 3

The situation before the starting signal is the same, but this time there is a general recall. The sail number of Boat A is displayed on the race committee starting vessel. Before the restart, Boat A informs the race committee that she intends to protest Boat B for breaking a rule of Part 2 in the recalled start.

Boat A starts, sails the course and finishes the restarted race. The race committee scores her DNE. Boat A lodges a protest against Boat B for the breach in the initial start and requests redress for the DNE score.

May the protest committee consider the breach in the recalled start and therefore apply rule 64.1(a) to give redress to Boat A, and score her in her finishing position in the re-started race?

Answer 3

No. Boat A initially broke the first sentence of rule 30.3, was identified and her sail number was properly displayed according to rule 30.3.

There is no procedure for a hearing on the water, and Boat A will not be exonerated immediately for breaking rule 30.3. The race committee shall display her sail number after a general recall and Boat A shall not sail in the restarted or resailed race. If she sails in the restarted or resailed race she breaks rule 30.3 again (third sentence) and her disqualification shall not be excluded in her series score, according to the last sentence of rule 30.3.

The protest committee will hear the protest and find facts. Based on those facts it will conclude that Boat B broke a rule of Part 2 (although it is prevented by rule 36 from penalizing Boat B for breaking a rule of Part 2) and also that Boat B compelled Boat A to break rule 30.3's first sentence. However, Boat A is not entitled to redress. There was no improper action or omission of the race committee, and in this case there was no injury or physical damage, and no unfair sailing or gross misconduct by Boat B. In addition, Boat A was also at fault in deciding to break rule 30.3's third sentence by sailing in the restarted race after her sail number had been displayed.

Question 4

The situation is the same as in Question 3 but this time Boat A does not sail in the restarted race. When she comes ashore, she protests Boat B for the breach in the initial start. The protest committee decides Boat B broke a rule of Part 2 (for which she cannot be penalized). Can the protest committee change Boat A's BFD score?

Answer 4

If the protest committee decides that Boat A was compelled to break rule 30.3's first sentence by Boat B, it will exonerate Boat A for breaking that rule, and will correct her score to DNS in the restarted race. As explained in Answer 3, it cannot use rule 62 to give Boat A a score or points for a finishing position.

In addition, exoneration under rule 64.1(a) may result in a finishing position being retained, but that rule cannot be used to award a score for a finishing position to a boat that did not start.