



The Racing Rules Committee met at 09:30 – 15:30 hours on Tuesday 6 November 2012 at the Royal Marine Hotel, Dun Laoghaire, Ireland

1. Opening of the Meeting	1	11. Report on finalization of Rule Book 2013 - 2016	6
2. Minutes of the Previous Meeting	1	12. Prescriptions	6
3. Approval of Sailing Instructions for the 2012 London Sailing Competition	1	13. Progress Reports on updated Case Book & Call Books	7
4. Items Deferred from November 2011	2	14. Report and Proposals on the Review of the Disciplinary Process of ISAF	7
5. The Racing Rules of Sailing	2	15. Special Working Parties	7
6. The Case Book	2	16. Annual Report	7
7. The Call Books for Match Racing & Team Racing	5	17. Discussion	7
8. ISAF Racing Rules Question & Answer Service	6	18. Any other Business	7
9. 2012 Olympic Sailing Competition	6		
10. Racing Rules Committee Representatives on other Committees	6		

Present:

David Tillett – Chairman

Bernard Bonneau – Vice Chairman

Bjorn Anker-Moller

Jim Capron

John Doerr

Kamen Fillyov

Ulrich Finckh

Carlos Gastelu

Luciano Giacomi

Rick Hatch

Nelson Horn Ilha

Oleg Ilyin

Oleg Ilyin

Marianne Middelthon

Bill O'Hara

John Parrish – (Race Officials – Rep: - Non Voting)

Dick Rose

Bo Samuelsson

Ana Sánchez del Campo Ferrer

Katsumi Shibamura

Leo Pieter Stoel

Richard Thompson

Zofia Truchanowicz

Apologies

Jack Lloyd

1. Opening of the Meeting

The Chairman welcomed everyone to the Racing Rules Committee in Dun Laoghaire. Dublin, Ireland.

2. Minutes of the Previous Meeting

(a) Minutes

The Committee noted the minutes of the Racing Rules Committee meeting of Tuesday 8 November 2011. The minutes can be downloaded at www.sailing.org/meetings

(b) Minutes Matters Arising

There were no other matters arising not covered elsewhere on this agenda.

3. Approval of Sailing Instructions for the 2012 London Sailing Competition

The Chairman noted that the Racing Rules Committee suggested edits to and then approved

Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

the Sailing Instructions for the 2012 London Sailing Competition.

4. Items Deferred from November 2011

(a) Submission 176-11

Deferred submission 176-11 from the Danish Sailing Association about Rule 69.

Note: The Racing Rules Committee decision in November 2011: Defer

Recommendation to Council: Submission Withdrawn

5. The Racing Rules of Sailing

(a) Submission 117-12

The Committee considered submission 117-12 from the Chairman of the Racing Rules Committee about Racing Rules of Sailing – New Appendix SY – Superyacht Racing Rules.

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following Amendment

Preamble

"When stated in the notice of race and the sailing instructions, Superyacht races shall be sailed under The Racing Rules of Sailing as changed by this appendix.

Version1, January 2013."

SY1

Change "30 metres" to "30.5 metres".

SY 3.3

Add new rule 60.4: "When the race committee or protest committee learns, from any source, of an incident involving boats sailing within 40 metres of each other, it may protest any boat involved."

Approved as an appendix to be placed on the ISAF website for development for the discipline.

The appendix may be amended with the approval of the RRC Chairman.

6. The Case Book

The Committee considered the following submissions and made recommendations to Council.

(a) Submission 116-12 - Rule 41 – Outside Help

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment.

Split the submission into two cases. The first case will comprise Questions 1 and 2 with the interpretation of rule 41(c). The second case will comprise Questions 3 and 4 about changing a rule in sailing instructions.

Both cases to be edited by Case Book WP and to take account of comments made by RRC members.

(b) Submission 118-12 - New Case - Basic Principle, Sportsmanship and the Rules

Recommendation to Council: Reject

The case is not wrong but it is not of general application and does not clarify the meaning of an important issue.

Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

- (c) Submission 119-12 - New Case - Rules 2, 62.1(d), 64.1
Recommendation to Council: Reject
Unnecessary. Fundamental requirement that protestee is identified is too obvious.
- (d) Submission 120-12 - New Case - Rules 29.1, 62.1. Race Signals, X
Recommendation to Council: Reject
Unnecessary.
- (e) Submission 121-12 - New Case - Rules 61.1(a), 63.5
Recommendation to Council: Reject
Does not properly address validity, which is the substance of the case.
- (f) Submission 122-12 - New Case - Rule 61.2
Recommendation to Council: Reject
RYA is encouraged to resubmit taking into account the comments of the RRC.
- (g) Submission 123-12 - New Case (A) - Rules 69, 69.2(c)
Recommendation to Council: Reject
The example is too complex. See Submission 125-12.
- (h) Submission 124-12 - New Case (B) - Rules 69, 69.2(c)
Recommendation to Council: Reject
Undesirable to use recent identifiable case. See Submission 125-12.
- (i) Submission 125-12 - New Case - Rule 69.2(c)
Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment
Approve with the addition of a sentence stating that "comfortable satisfaction" is used by the Court of Arbitration for Sport.
Case Book Working Party to edit and include the concept set out in the final paragraph of Submission 124.12, Comparison with other Standards of Proof.
Case Book WP to include an example along the lines of the example in Submission 124-12. The edited case is to be approved by the RRC.
- (j) Submission 126-12 - New Cases - Regulation 28,3,6
Notes: Submission 126-12 proposes that each of 17 current Q&As become cases. Therefore, a row of this table is provided for each of these 17 proposals.
All approvals under this submission are approvals in principle and the Case Book Working Party is to prepare new submissions in 2013 that include the full text of each proposed case.
- (k) 126-12 - B 004 Racing Rules of Sailing - New Case
Recommendation to Council: Approve
- (l) 126-12 - B 011 Racing Rules of Sailing - New Case
Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment
Implement by amending Case 11.
- (m) 126-12 - B 017 Racing Rules of Sailing - New Case

Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

Recommendation to Council: Approve

- (n) 126-12 - B 024 Racing Rules of Sailing - New Case

Recommendation to Council: Approve

- (o) 126-12 - C 003 Racing Rules of Sailing - New Case

Recommendation to Council: Reject

- (p) 126-12 - D 006 Racing Rules of Sailing - New Case

Recommendation to Council: Approve

- (q) 126-12 - E 001 Racing Rules of Sailing - New Case

Recommendation to Council: Approve

- (r) 126-12 - E 002 Racing Rules of Sailing - New Case

Recommendation to Council: Approve

- (s) 126-12 - E 005 Racing Rules of Sailing - New Case

Recommendation to Council: Reject

Adds nothing to Case 45 and would just make Case 45 confusing.

- (t) 126-12 - E 006 Racing Rules of Sailing - New Case

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment

Add to Case 45.

- (u) 126-12 - G 010 Racing Rules of Sailing - New Case

Recommendation to Council: Reject

Inconsistent.

- (v) 126-12 - G 012 Racing Rules of Sailing - New Case

Recommendation to Council: Reject

Case Book WP is to prepare a revision to Case 79 to include the essence of this Q&A.

- (w) 126-12 - J 013 Racing Rules of Sailing - New Case

Recommendation to Council: Reject

RRC Working Party to consider if rule 61.1(a)(4) can be improved.

- (x) 126-12 - J 021 Racing Rules of Sailing - New Case

Recommendation to Council: Approve

- (y) 126-12 - M 001 Racing Rules of Sailing - New Case

Recommendation to Council: Approve

- (z) 126-12 - M 006 Racing Rules of Sailing - New Case

Recommendation to Council: Approve

- (aa) 126-12 - M 009 Racing Rules of Sailing - New Case

Recommendation to Council: Approve

7. The Call Books for Match Racing & Team Racing

The Committee considered the following submissions and made recommendations to Council.

- (a) Submission 127-12 - Restructure the Call Book for Match Racing to that of the Call Book for Team Racing

Recommendation to Council: Approve

- (b) Submission 128-12 - The Call Book for Match Racing & the Call Book for Team Racing - Insert Prefix

Recommendation to Council: Approve

- (c) Submission 129-12 - The Call Book for Team Racing - Align Formats

Recommendation to Council: Approve

- (d) Submission 130-12 - The Call Book for Match Racing - Delete GEN 1, GEN 2 and UMP 20 Q 1

Recommendation to Council: Approve

- (e) Submission 131-12 - The Call Book for Match Racing - Delete Calls UMP 2, 43 and MR 47

Recommendation to Council: Approve

- (f) Submission 132-12 - The Call Book for Match Racing - Split MR 4

Approve to Council: Approve

- (g) Submission 133-12 - The Call Book for Match Racing - Split UMP 9

Recommendation to Council: Approve

- (h) Submission 134-12 - The Call Book for Match Racing - Amend Call UMP 17

Recommendation to Council: Approve

- (i) Submission 135-12 - The Call Book for Match Racing - Amend Call UMP 20

Recommendation to Council: Approve

- (j) Submission 136-12 - The Call Book for Match Racing - Delete Call MR 43

Recommendation to Council: Approve

- (k) Submission 137-12 - Call Book for Team Racing - Move Call D9 to Section E

Recommendation to Council: Approve

- (l) Submission 138-12 - The Call Book for Team Racing - Delete TR Call E11

Recommendation to Council: Approve

- (m) Submission 139-12 - The Call Book for Team Racing - Reject RR Call 2011.2

Recommendation to Council: Approve

- (n) Submission 140-12 - The Call Book for Team Racing - Delete TR Call B8

Recommendation to Council: Approve

- (o) Submission 141-12 - The Call Book for Team Racing - Amend TR Call M9

Recommendation to Council: Approve

8. ISAF Racing Rules Question & Answer Service

The Committee received a report from the Chairman of the Racing Rules Q&A Panel about the ISAF Racing Rules Question and Answer Service in 2012.

9. 2012 Olympic Sailing Competition

- (a) The Committee received a report from the Chairman of the Racing Rules Committee and the Head of ISAF Competition Department.
The Chairman thanked John Doerr, Jan Stage and Jim Capron for all their work preparing the documents for the 2012 Olympic Sailing Competition. It was noted that there were a very large number of documents outlining the rules and policies of the event. It was also noted that Swiss Timing had used a full tracking system for the event and that ISAF should develop a set of standard criteria to enable the Jury to receive data that can be then used during hearings.

10. Racing Rules Committee Representatives on other Committees

- (a) Equipment Committee
The Committee received a verbal report from the Equipment Committee representative.
- (b) Equipment Control Sub-committee
The Committee received a verbal report from the Equipment Control Sub-committee representative.
- (c) Class Rule Sub-committee
The Committee received a verbal report from the Class Rule Sub-committee representative.
- (d) Race Officials Committee
The Committee received a verbal report from the Race Officials Committee representative.
- (e) Windsurfing & Kiteboarding Committee
The Committee receive a verbal report from the Chairman of the Windsurfing & Kiteboarding Committee.

11. Report on finalization of Rule Book 2013 - 2016

The Committee received a verbal report from the Chairman of the Racing Rules Committee. The Chairman thanked everyone from the Working Party for all of their hard work.

12. Prescriptions

The Committee discussed the new National Authority Prescriptions from 2013 to be added to the web page on the ISAF website. It was noted that the Committee should review all prescriptions with a view to developing future versions of RRS. It was also noted that National Authority Prescriptions should be reviewed before being published on the ISAF website.

13. Progress Reports on updated Case Book & Call Books

- (a) The Committee received a progress report from Dick Rose on the updated Case Book.
- (b) The Committee received a progress report from Marianne Middelthon on the updated Call Books.

The Chairman thanked both Dick Rose and Marianne Middelthon for all of their hard work on the Case Cook and Call Books

14. Report and Proposals on the Review of the Disciplinary Process of ISAF

The Committee considered the report and draft submissions prepared by the Working Party. It was agreed that the Committee should give feedback to the Executive Committee in time for submissions to be made in November 2013.

15. Special Working Parties

- (a) The Committee received a progress report from the Section C Working Party made by Dick Rose and Richard Thompson.
- (b) The Committee received a progress report from the Rule 28 Working Party made by Dick Rose.
- (c) The Committee received a progress report from the Rule 90.1 Working Party made by Dick Rose.

The Chairman noted these Working Parties cease as of the end of the meeting, their work completed.

16. Annual Report

The Committee noted the Chairman's report to the ISAF Council meeting of 08 November 2012 on the activities of the Racing Rules Committee for the period 1 January to date.

17. Discussion

The Chairman noted the following topics that the new Racing Rules Committee might consider during the years 2013-2016.

- (a) Format of Appendices B, C, D, E and F.
- (b) Simplification of rule 42, Propulsion.
- (c) Appointment of an Appendix B Working Party to simplify and shorten Appendix B and develop standard sailing instructions covering special formats and disciplines other than course racing.

18. Any other Business

Submission 008-12 – ISAF Committee Appointments – Nomination and Appointments Process – Regulation 5

Recommendation to Council: No Recommendation

Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

The Chairman thanked everyone on the Committee, various Working Parties, Vice-President Eric Tulla and the ISAF Secretariat for all of their hard work over the last four years.

There being no further business, the meeting was closed